

Message

From: Kaiser, Russell [Kaiser.Russell@epa.gov]
Sent: 7/24/2018 8:50:32 PM
To: Wade, Alexis [Wade.Alexis@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Russell L. Kaiser
Chief, Freshwater and Marine Regulatory Branch
Oceans, Wetlands and Communities Division
Office of Wetlands, Oceans and Watersheds
1301 Constitution Ave., N.W.
Room 7114B West Bldg.
Washington, DC 20004
P: 202.566.0963

C: Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

From: Wade, Alexis
Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 4:26 PM
To: Kupchan, Simma <Kupchan.Simma@epa.gov>; Kaiser, Russell <Kaiser.Russell@epa.gov>; Wehling, Carrie <Wehling.Carrie@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

Ex. 5 AC/DP

Alexis Wade
Attorney-Adviser
Water Law Office
EPA Office of General Counsel
(202) 564-3273

From: Kupchan, Simma
Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 4:22 PM
To: Kaiser, Russell <Kaiser.Russell@epa.gov>; Wehling, Carrie <Wehling.Carrie@epa.gov>; Wade, Alexis <Wade.Alexis@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

Fine with me, but Alexis is the expert.

Simma Kupchan
EPA Office of General Counsel
Water Law Office
202-564-3105
WJC North #7426Q

From: Kaiser, Russell
Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 4:19 PM
To: Wehling, Carrie <Wehling.Carrie@epa.gov>; Wade, Alexis <Wade.Alexis@epa.gov>; Hurlid, Kathy <Hurlid.Kathy@epa.gov>; FertikEdgerton, Rachel <FertikEdgerton.Rachel@epa.gov>; Kupchan, Simma <Kupchan.Simma@epa.gov>
Cc: Frazer, Brian <Frazer.Brian@epa.gov>; Goodin, John <Goodin.John@epa.gov>; McDavit, Michael W. <Mcdavit.Michael@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up
Importance: High

Simma, Carrie, Alexis: Thanks... Note that I made a few more modifications for brevity purposes. Also,

Ex. 5 AC/DP

Ex. 5 AC/DP

Russell L. Kaiser
Chief, Freshwater and Marine Regulatory Branch
Oceans, Wetlands and Communities Division
Office of Wetlands, Oceans and Watersheds
1301 Constitution Ave., N.W.
Room 7114B West Bldg.
Washington, DC 20004
P: 202.566.0963
C: **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**

From: Wehling, Carrie
Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 3:40 PM

To: Wade, Alexis <Wade.Alexis@epa.gov>; Hurlid, Kathy <Hurlid.Kathy@epa.gov>; FertikEdgerton, Rachel <FertikEdgerton.Rachel@epa.gov>; Kaiser, Russell <Kaiser.Russell@epa.gov>; Kupchan, Simma <Kupchan.Simma@epa.gov>
Cc: Frazer, Brian <Frazer.Brian@epa.gov>; Goodin, John <Goodin.John@epa.gov>; McDavit, Michael W. <Mcdavit.Michael@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

Looks good, Alexis. Thanks.

Caroline (Carrie) Wehling
Assistant General Counsel
Water Law Office
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Washington DC 20004
202-564-5492
wehling.carrie@epa.gov

From: Wade, Alexis
Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 3:01 PM
To: Hurlid, Kathy <Hurlid.Kathy@epa.gov>; FertikEdgerton, Rachel <FertikEdgerton.Rachel@epa.gov>; Kaiser, Russell <Kaiser.Russell@epa.gov>; Kupchan, Simma <Kupchan.Simma@epa.gov>
Cc: Frazer, Brian <Frazer.Brian@epa.gov>; Goodin, John <Goodin.John@epa.gov>; McDavit, Michael W. <Mcdavit.Michael@epa.gov>; Wehling, Carrie <Wehling.Carrie@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

It's fine with me to delete that clause.

Alexis Wade
Attorney-Adviser
Water Law Office
EPA Office of General Counsel
(202) 564-3273

From: Hurlid, Kathy
Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 3:00 PM
To: Wade, Alexis <Wade.Alexis@epa.gov>; FertikEdgerton, Rachel <FertikEdgerton.Rachel@epa.gov>; Kaiser, Russell <Kaiser.Russell@epa.gov>; Kupchan, Simma <Kupchan.Simma@epa.gov>
Cc: Frazer, Brian <Frazer.Brian@epa.gov>; Goodin, John <Goodin.John@epa.gov>; McDavit, Michael W. <Mcdavit.Michael@epa.gov>; Wehling, Carrie <Wehling.Carrie@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP) - Kathy

From: Wade, Alexis
Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 2:53 PM
To: FertikEdgerton, Rachel <FertikEdgerton.Rachel@epa.gov>; Kaiser, Russell <Kaiser.Russell@epa.gov>; Hurlid, Kathy <Hurlid.Kathy@epa.gov>; Kupchan, Simma <Kupchan.Simma@epa.gov>
Cc: Frazer, Brian <Frazer.Brian@epa.gov>; Goodin, John <Goodin.John@epa.gov>; McDavit, Michael W.

<Mcdavit.Michael@epa.gov>; Wehling, Carrie <Wehling.Carrie@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

Adding Carrie to this chain. Here's my suggestion:

Ex. 5 AC/DP

Ex. 5 AC/DP

Alexis Wade
Attorney-Adviser
Water Law Office
EPA Office of General Counsel
(202) 564-3273

From: FertikEdgerton, Rachel

Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 2:19 PM

To: Kaiser, Russell <Kaiser.Russell@epa.gov>; Hurlid, Kathy <Hurlid.Kathy@epa.gov>; Kupchan, Simma <Kupchan.Simma@epa.gov>

Cc: Frazer, Brian <Frazer.Brian@epa.gov>; Goodin, John <Goodin.John@epa.gov>; McDavit, Michael W. <Mcdavit.Michael@epa.gov>; Wade, Alexis <Wade.Alexis@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

Too late, here is my draft:

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

From: Kaiser, Russell

Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 1:39 PM

To: Hurlid, Kathy <Hurlid.Kathy@epa.gov>; Kupchan, Simma <Kupchan.Simma@epa.gov>; FertikEdgerton, Rachel <FertikEdgerton.Rachel@epa.gov>

Cc: Frazer, Brian <Frazer.Brian@epa.gov>; Goodin, John <Goodin.John@epa.gov>; McDavit, Michael W. <Mcdavit.Michael@epa.gov>; Wade, Alexis <Wade.Alexis@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

All – pls -- pens down. I have talked with Alexis and she is going to review and revise or pull something from the CWR. Thanks Alexis.

Russell L. Kaiser
Chief, Freshwater and Marine Regulatory Branch

Oceans, Wetlands and Communities Division
Office of Wetlands, Oceans and Watersheds
1301 Constitution Ave., N.W.
Room 7114B West Bldg.
Washington, DC 20004
P: 202.566.0963

C: Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

From: Kaiser, Russell

Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 1:30 PM

To: Hurld, Kathy <Hurld.Kathy@epa.gov>; Kupchan, Simma <Kupchan.Simma@epa.gov>; FertikEdgerton, Rachel <FertikEdgerton.Rachel@epa.gov>

Cc: Frazer, Brian <Frazer.Brian@epa.gov>; Goodin, John <Goodin.John@epa.gov>; McDavit, Michael W. <Mcdavit.Michael@epa.gov>; Wade, Alexis <Wade.Alexis@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP) Thank you

Russell L. Kaiser
Chief, Freshwater and Marine Regulatory Branch
Oceans, Wetlands and Communities Division
Office of Wetlands, Oceans and Watersheds
1301 Constitution Ave., N.W.
Room 7114B West Bldg.
Washington, DC 20004
P: 202.566.0963

C: Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

From: Hurld, Kathy

Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 12:17 PM

To: Kupchan, Simma <Kupchan.Simma@epa.gov>; FertikEdgerton, Rachel <FertikEdgerton.Rachel@epa.gov>; Kaiser, Russell <Kaiser.Russell@epa.gov>

Cc: Frazer, Brian <Frazer.Brian@epa.gov>; Goodin, John <Goodin.John@epa.gov>; McDavit, Michael W. <Mcdavit.Michael@epa.gov>; Wade, Alexis <Wade.Alexis@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

I sent an additional sentence to Alexis and Simma to consider that

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

From: Kupchan, Simma
Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 10:57 AM
To: FertikEdgerton, Rachel <FertikEdgerton.Rachel@epa.gov>; Kaiser, Russell <Kaiser.Russell@epa.gov>
Cc: Hurlid, Kathy <Hurlid.Kathy@epa.gov>; Frazer, Brian <Frazer.Brian@epa.gov>; Goodin, John <Goodin.John@epa.gov>; McDavit, Michael W. <Mcdavit.Michael@epa.gov>; Wade, Alexis <Wade.Alexis@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

Thanks, Rachel.

Alexis, could you take a look at the language below? (Alexis is not actually in the office at the moment and is dealing with some other matters, but kindly offered to help with this today as soon as is free. Thank you, Alexis!)

Ex. 5 AC/DP

Simma Kupchan
EPA Office of General Counsel
Water Law Office
202-564-3105
WJC North #7426Q

From: FertikEdgerton, Rachel
Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 10:48 AM
To: Kaiser, Russell <Kaiser.Russell@epa.gov>; Kupchan, Simma <Kupchan.Simma@epa.gov>
Cc: Hurlid, Kathy <Hurlid.Kathy@epa.gov>; Frazer, Brian <Frazer.Brian@epa.gov>; Goodin, John <Goodin.John@epa.gov>; McDavit, Michael W. <Mcdavit.Michael@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

Here is some draft language for Simma and Alexis to review. Citations could be moved to footnotes for improved readability.

Ex. 5 AC/DP

Please continue to reply-all so we all stay up to speed since this is a quick turnaround.

Thanks,
Rachel

From: Kaiser, Russell
Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 9:11 AM
To: FertikEdgerton, Rachel <FertikEdgerton.Rachel@epa.gov>; Kupchan, Simma <Kupchan.Simma@epa.gov>
Cc: Hurlid, Kathy <Hurlid.Kathy@epa.gov>; Frazer, Brian <Frazer.Brian@epa.gov>; Goodin, John <Goodin.John@epa.gov>

McDavit, Michael W. <Mcdavit.Michael@epa.gov>

Subject: FW: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

Rachel,

I need you to work on the below task ASAP. Response can be brief. For example, two sentences. One Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Rachel – after we reach agreement on the language, pls insert as described below and forward to all parties. **Please note this is due today.**

Russell L. Kaiser
Chief, Freshwater and Marine Regulatory Branch
Oceans, Wetlands and Communities Division
Office of Wetlands, Oceans and Watersheds
1301 Constitution Ave., N.W.
Room 7114B West Bldg.
Washington, DC 20004
P: 202.566.0963

C Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

From: Goodin, John

Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 8:26 AM

To: Frazer, Brian <Frazer.Brian@epa.gov>; Kaiser, Russell <Kaiser.Russell@epa.gov>

Cc: Connors, Sandra <Connors.Sandra@epa.gov>; McDavit, Michael W. <Mcdavit.Michael@epa.gov>

Subject: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

Morning, Folks--Need to do this today: Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Thanks

John

From: Forsgren, Lee

Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 8:15 AM

To: Goodin, John <Goodin.John@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: Shellfish Follow-up

John,

Can you put in the ESA discussion and then I will get this to Chairman Graves.

Lee

From: Goodin, John

Sent: Monday, July 23, 2018 2:56 PM

To: Forsgren, Lee <Forsgren.Lee@epa.gov>

Subject: Shellfish Follow-up

Per discussion, see below.

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: Goodin, John

Sent: Tuesday, June 12, 2018 2:49 PM

To: Forsgren, Lee <Forsgren.Lee@epa.gov>

Cc: Campbell, Ann <Campbell.Ann@epa.gov>; Frazer, Brian <Frazer.Brian@epa.gov>; Russell Kaiser <Kaiser.Russell@epa.gov>; Sandra Connors (Connors.Sandra@epa.gov) <Connors.Sandra@epa.gov>

Subject: Shellfish Follow-up

Lee—below is our coordinated response with OGC that addresses the questions below regarding

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Thanks,

John

Question: do normal commercial shellfish farming activities usually result in discharges of dredged or fill material, as those terms are defined under Section 404 of the Clean Water Act?

Answer:

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Question: To the extent any shellfish farming activities do involve regulated discharges of dredged or fill material, is the Clean Water Act Section 404(f)(1)(A) exemption applicable to shellfish farming, including seeding, cultivation, and harvesting activities?

Answer:

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

From: "Forsgren, Lee" <Forsgren.Lee@epa.gov>
Date: June 5, 2018 at 10:12:11 PM EDT
To: "Bennitt, Ian" <ian.Bennitt@mail.house.gov>
Cc: "Goodin, John" <Goodin.John@epa.gov>, "Ross, David P" <ross.davidp@epa.gov>, "Ringel, Aaron" <ringel.aaron@epa.gov>, "Lyons, Troy" <lyons.troy@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: Shellfish

Ian,

Let me do some checking and get back to you ASAP.

Lee

Sent from my iPhone

On Jun 5, 2018, at 9:19 PM, Bennitt, Ian <ian.Bennitt@mail.house.gov> wrote:

Lee – following up. Can we request some TA from yall with regard to our shellfish issue. Specifically, we would like to know whether EPA concurs with the Army Corps of Engineers' position, as stated in the March 2016 draft preamble to the 2017 Nationwide Permit 48, regarding the applicability of Section 404 of the Clean Water Act to commercial shellfish farming activities, including:

- i. That normal commercial shellfish farming activities usually do not result in discharges of dredged or fill material, as those terms are defined under Section 404 of the Clean Water Act; and
- ii. That, to the extent any shellfish farming activities do involve regulated discharges of dredged or fill material, the Clean Water Act Section 404(f)(1)(A) exemption is applicable to shellfish farming, including seeding, cultivation, and harvesting activities.

Thanks for your help,

Ian H. Bennitt

Staff Director, Water Resources and Environment Subcommittee

Committee on Transportation and Infrastructure

202-225-4360

This email and any related communications, documents, notes, draft legislation, recommendations, reports, or other materials generated or received by the Members or staff of the U.S. House of Representatives Committee on Transportation and Infrastructure are congressional records and remain subject to the Committee's control, and are entrusted to your agency only for use in handling this matter. Any such documents created or compiled by an agency in connection with any response to this Committee document or any related Committee communications, whether made by phone, email, or document, including any replies to the Committee, are also records of the Committee and remain subject to the Committee's control. Accordingly, the aforementioned documents are not "agency records" for purposes of the Freedom of Information Act or any other law, and should be segregated from agency records.